

PEACE AND JUSTICE IN THE HAGUE'S CHURCH



23 May 2019

Word count: 10,140

Dylan Kraijenoord | 15010856 | ES-4

Margriet Krijtenburg | Supervisor

The Hague University of Applied Sciences

Faculty of Management & Organisation

European Studies

Commissioned by The Hague's International Affairs Department

Executive Summary

The purpose of this report is to document research conducted at The Hague University of Applied Sciences, commissioned by The Hague's International Affairs Department, on the topic of the Bethel's church asylum of the Tamrazyan family in The Hague. The specific case of the Tamrazyan family, who found sanctuary in Bethel's Chapel and community centre, has been researched to find out whether it strengthened The Hague's brand of peace and justice. In order to answer this question, a theoretical framework has been set up to limit the research. It has been decided to focus on the Tamrazyan case to limit the research. More importantly, because no research has been done into this specific case yet. The qualitative desk has been chosen to conclude this research. Used sources include academic sources, institutional sources, official governmental, municipal and local documents of the city of The Hague, journalistic sources and three conducted interviews.

The results showed that Bethel's church asylum did not only bring harmony between the participating churches and NGOs, but it also contributed to the overall harmony in The Hague. It showed that churches and NGOs can have direct influence inside a local community by stimulating discussions on peace policy issues and human rights. Additionally, the widespread support and attention by means of media coverage caught people's attention at home and abroad. The Hague's City Branding Bureau, that monitors Hague's brand of Peace and Justice, stimulates independent local initiatives that also strengthen the brand of Peace and Justice. Bethel's church asylum is seen as one. The discussion showed that justice can be interpreted in different ways. It is a fact that both sides simplify the demand for a clear and fair application procedure for asylum-seekers.

These findings led to the conclusion that the Bethel's church asylum of the Tamrazyan family increased the image of the international profile of Peace and Justice. However, it did not only result in a residence permit for the Tamrazyan family, but it is also believed to be the cause for the turning point in Dutch government concerning the children's pardon. The International Affairs Department is recommended to actively monitor more on cases such as the Bethel's church asylum, to cooperate more often with local churches and to provide more clear information about the Dutch application procedure for asylum-seekers.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Margriet Krijtenburg, who provided guidance and support from the first meeting through to completion of the dissertation. Thank you for having faith in the topic of this dissertation.

I also want to thank my assignment provider, Wim Jansen, who saw potential in the outcome of this dissertation. As a matter of fact, thank you to the entire Department of International Affairs of the city of The Hague under Wim Jansen's leadership. It was also your support and recommendations that helped me conclude this dissertation.

I thank Yardéna Verhoog who served as a proof-reader. I am grateful for your expertise and your support on the way. To the interviewees, Sibel Kilinc, Maaïke Harmsen and John van Tilborg. Thank you for sharing experiences with me; you were open and honest. It was my great pleasure to have spoken to you.

I also thank the Tamrazyan family. It was your courage to seek shelter in the Bethel Chapel and Community Centre. Ultimately, the church asylum in which you were involved is the main focus of this dissertation. I would also like to thank the Bethel Chapel and Community Centre itself and all the people involved in the process. Thank you for helping and supporting the family.

Most importantly, I would like to honour God. Without His guidance and love I would not be writing this acknowledgement. You deserve all the glory.

List of Abbreviations

BSD-I	=	Department of International Affairs of the city of The Hague
CDA	=	The Dutch Christian Democratic Appeal (political party)
DSO	=	Department of Urban Development of the city of The Hague
CBS	=	Statistics Netherlands
CGK	=	Christian Reformed Churches
EU	=	European Union
FBO	=	Faith-based Organisation
GKV	=	Reformed Churches in The Netherlands (Liberated)
ICC	=	International Criminal Court
IGO	=	Intergovernmental Organisation
IND	=	Immigration and Naturalisation Service (Netherlands)
NGK	=	Netherlands Reformed Churches
NGO	=	Non-governmental Organisation
PKN	=	Protestant Church in The Netherlands
RUG	=	University of Groningen
STEK	=	The Foundation for City & Church
VU	=	Free University Amsterdam
VVD	=	The Dutch People's Party for Freedom and Democracy
INLIA	=	International Network of Local Initiatives with Refugees

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	6
2. Theoretical Framework	7
3. Methodology	11
4. Results	13
4.1. Protected by Justice.....	13
4.2. Churches United.....	16
4.3. Supporting NGOs	19
4.4. International Publicity	22
4.5. City Branding.....	25
5. Discussion	28
6. Conclusion.....	31
7. Recommendation	31
8. References	33
9. Appendices	39
9.1. Transcript Interview Maaïke Harmsen, theologian	39
9.2. Informed Consent Form Interview Maaïke Harmsen	45
9.3. Transcript Interview John van Tilborg, managing director INLIA.	46
9.4. Informed Consent Form Interview John van Tilborg.....	52
9.5. Transcript Interview Sibel Kilinc, program manager international profiling of The Hague's City Branding Department.	53
9.6. Informed Consent Form Interview Sibel Kilinc.....	59
9.7. Student's Ethics Form.....	60

1. Introduction

The Bethel's Chapel church asylum is said to be the promoter of the political changes concerning the children's pardon. At the end of January 2019, the four government parties agreed to grant a residence permit to the almost entire current group of so-called "rooted" children. In February 2019, it was announced by the IND that 1,070 refugee children are being reassessed as to whether or not they are allowed to remain in The Netherlands (De Goede, 2019). The Armenian family called Tamrazyan, are among the first to receive the happy tidings; They are allowed to remain in The Netherlands. The family, including their children Hayarpi (21), Warduhi (19) and Seyran (15), has been awaiting news of their permanent asylum residence permit for nine years. According to the established Dutch children's pardon, the family was eligible to receive a residence permit after five years. However, after being rejected for a residence permit several times, the family was about to be sent back to Armenia in 2018. The family decided to seek refuge as they no longer felt safe. They felt justice was no longer on their side (Huisman, 2018).

The 97 days of sanctuary at Bethel's Chapel caught the public eye and prevented earlier deportation (De Goede, 2019). According to Bethel's asylum coordinator Stegeman, the church harboured the family not only for their benefit but also to send a message to the government. "We wanted to stretch time to give the politicians the opportunity to reconsider this family's permit as well as all the other families" (Stegeman, 2019). It had a great impact on society. As a result, people from all over the country and beyond rallied themselves to aid the church in support of this family. A new kind of solidarity has grown in The Hague through the church shelter (Huisman, 2019).

More research needs to be done to find out whether the church sanctuary has strengthened The Hague's profile of Peace and Justice. This dissertation examines how justice is applied in practice - or not - and whether the situation has brought more unity between different religious denominations. In addition, the role of media in regard to The Hague's church sanctuary is examined as is its contribution to an improved international position of The Hague. Furthermore, the research investigates how the municipality of The Hague promotes its brand of 'Peace and Justice' in practice through its City Branding Bureau. Finally, it examines how the NGOs in The Hague have contributed to the Bethel's church sanctuary in an attempt to gain the residence permit of the Tamrazyan family and many others in The Netherlands.

All of this is commissioned by The Hague's International Affairs Department.

2. Theoretical Framework

No research has been done as yet on the topic of this dissertation: the contribution of Bethel's church sanctuary to The Hague's international profile of Peace and Justice. So as to achieve a deeper understanding of the impact of this example of church asylum on The Hague's branding as city of justice and peace. Furthermore, to provide more insight on what is written about church asylum and asylum policy as such and on the content of the city branding of The Hague. It will also provide more background information on the Bethel church. A variety of articles and books are written on the national asylum policy. In order to decrease the research content, the focus of this literature review will be the combination of both the asylum policy and the concept of church asylum.

In this dissertation, a refugee is referring to a person who has been forced to flee their country because of (in Tamrazyan's case) political conviction and cannot return home safely. Such a person can also be referred to as an asylum seeker when they formally make a claim for asylum (CBS, n.d.).

Church Asylum & National Policy - Mitchell and Macfarlane (2018), both professors at the University of California, wrote a research on 'Transnational Church Activism and Refugee Protection in Europe'. In their research they focus on the relationship between the contemporary sanctuary movement (see 'sanctuary movement') and refugees. Both authors observed that the clerical protection of those at risk of deportation brought about a broader sense of solidarity among local residents. It is stated that clerical protection of refugees also affected governmental policy decisions (Mitchell & Macfarlane, 2018, p.36). They conclude that there is indeed a connection between the church and refugees that are being protected by the church. (Mitchell & Macfarlane, 2018, p.45). Moreover, that the church in general is striving to close the gap between an asylum seeker's need for reliable accommodations and the political recognition of those seeking refuge (Mitchell & Macfarlane, 2018, p.47).

Furthermore, Dr. L. Rabben (2016), Associate Research Professor Anthropology at the University of Maryland, concluded in her study "Sanctuary and Asylum: A Social and Political History" that the principle of church asylum emerged from faith-based communities in order to become part of the secular political culture. That is closely linked to The Hague's church asylum with an international profile (Peace and Justice) (Johnston, 2005, p.209). Additionally, Dr. S. Snyder (2012), Assistant Professor of Contemporary Society and Christian Ethics at the Philadelphia Divinity School, argues that Christian communities bring

change into the lives of migrants. Those who are seeking refuge find it in faith-based communities. In Snyder's book, she continues stating that church asylum makes substantial, valuable contributions to society (p.45, 2012). This statement is of interest for this study as it is focused on the contribution of The Hague's church asylum to justice and peace in the city. It is noticeable that the outcome of several researchers concludes that church asylum in general contributes to a secure perception of not only the refugees, but also of local citizens (Snyder, p.49, 2012; Rabben, p.33, 2016).

Dr. Snyder goes on to state that church asylum does not only affect those on the receiving end of sanctuary, but in most of the cases the entire community involved. Whether people believe in something or nothing at all, it leaves a trademark (Snyder, p.54, 2012). For this reason, the dissertation will focus on The Hague's church asylum policy. This particular case did not just impact the people inside the Bethel community, but also the entire city on a local and international level (Huisman, 2019). In addition, the case studies that L. Rabben included in her research all show how church asylums across the world reinforced the local community's sense of solidarity. This phenomenon also returned in the aforementioned study of Snyder.

An apparent pattern that you see with these different sources is that they all focus on the risks in children's well-being if they were to be deported to another country. Furthermore, the research dives deeper into the role of the church. The church cannot act on its own. On the other hand, there are researchers that deny the religious sanctity. Former Professor of Law at Pace University, S. Prakash Sinha, stated in her book "Asylum and International Law" that it is not necessarily a church that gives asylum to refugees. According to Sinha, it is the sovereignty of the city/state that has laid the foundation of asylum. She does not recognize the religious sanctity of the places of refuge. Especially, after the critical separation between church and state. However, in the Tamrazyan case it can be seen how the church is contributing more to society again and how it is influencing politics as well. Though it is not the main reason as to why the church is assisting in this matter. It is about hospitality and protection of those seeking asylum, rather than political interest.

Additionally, the aforementioned studies of Snyder, Rabben, Mitchell & Macfarlane agree that church asylum is timeless. Churches today are inspired by those who have gone before. Although church asylum does not officially exist, it has been a valuable principle from the time the church still had a privilege to receive refugees (Snyder, 2012). The Dutch government has stated on several occasions that they do not consider themselves bound

by church asylum, however nor has the Dutch government used its authorities to interrupt such a church asylum (De Jonge, 2019). It is stated by aforementioned studies that church asylum can temporarily stop an eviction and start a controversial discussion in society (Rabben, 2016; Mitchell & Macfarlane, 2018). In the case of the Tamrazyan family, the discussion started on the children's pardon and the asylum policy's broadening.

Sanctuary Movement - A movement that is crucial to explain for this dissertation is the church sanctuary movement. In the specific case of this dissertation, the Tamrazyan family decided to flee to the church to seek refuge. Both Katwijk and The Hague church took them in and organized an uninterrupted service to protect the family from deportation. The non-governmental organization INLIA recently reported that church asylum is not an unknown phenomenon in The Netherlands. In fact, between 1978 and 2000 asylum was granted by church a total of 52 times. After 2000, the need for asylum declined because asylum seekers who had exhausted all legal remedies were not actively deported. The request for church asylum showed an increase again starting in 2015 (INLIA, 2018). The decline of church asylum is not only due to the decrease of asylum seekers in The Netherlands, but it is also linked to the rise of secularisation in Europe. In this context, secularisation is meant as the process whereby the church as an institution loses influence in society (Van Houten, 2018). This includes the trend that fewer and fewer people visit the church, and also the separation of Church and state. Therefore, the principle of church asylum, where persecuted people needed sanctuary, came to an end. In theory this was true due to citizens now being protected by the judiciary system against possible breaches of state authority. In practice, people all over Europe still seek refuge in a church, although it no longer happens in large numbers (INLIA, 2018, para.5).

Rooted Theory - The theory of rooting can be explained with the scientific note about the expected damage of deportation to the development of rooted children in The Netherlands. The note was written by Prof. Erik Scherder, professor of clinical neuropsychology at the VU University Amsterdam and by Dr. Elianne Zijlstra (RUG) and Dr. Carla van Os (RUG), affiliated with the Research and Expertise Centre for Children and Immigration Law of the University of Groningen. From their scientific points of view, it has been argued that deportation of children who are staying in a country for more than 5 years does more harm than good (Schreuder et al., 2018, p.1. As mentioned before, the Tamrazyan family has been living in The Netherlands since 2010. In 2018, the Tamrazyan family received news that they were to be deported back to Romania (Huisman, 2019). According to Prof. Schreuder, dr. Van Os and dr. Zijlstra, these children run a high risk of damage in their

physical, emotional and social development (Schreuder et al., 2018, p.2). They continue by stating that the children are extremely vulnerable because of the continual stress and lack of stability (Schreuder et al., 2018, p.4). The years of fearing forced eviction threatens their development, which has major consequences for both their current and future functioning. The chronic stress to which these children are exposed to may have impaired their brain functions. It impairs them in such a way that the chance of recovery and ability to adapt to the living conditions in their country of origin has become extremely small. According to current scientific insights it makes the deportation of these children, who are long-term residents in the Netherlands, irresponsible (Schreuder et al., 2018, p.11).

Peace and Justice - The Hague's brand of Peace and Justice is researched as this dissertation not only examines the church sanctuary, but also focuses on whether the case strengthened this specific Hague brand. In chapter 5.5, the City Branding Bureau has been explained which is responsible for monitoring and strengthening The Hague brand. Another department that is committed to the position of The Hague as International City of Peace and Justice is the International Affairs Department (BSD-I). This commitment is also reflected in the coalition agreement and mentioned as one of the five pillars of The Hague (Bouwman, November 2018). Both BSD-I and City Branding show that The Hague's brand belongs to the core values of the city and its aim to give peace and justice an important place in the hearts and actions of The Hague citizens. The international aspect is described by the fact that The Hague is known worldwide as a beacon of international law. Moreover, justice is spoken in this city to secure international peace. More detailed information about The Hague's brand and the Bureau that monitors it can be found in chapter 5.5.

To conclude, the research gap on the topic of church asylum is the specific case of the Tamrazyan family who found sanctuary in Bethel's Chapel and community centre from October 26, 2018 to January 30, 2019. The family's case is of interest because it did not only result in a residence permit for the Tamrazyan family, but it also caused a turning point for many children in The Netherlands. In January 2019, the Dutch coalition parties decided that the entire current group of children would be reassessed. It is believed that the Bethel's church asylum was the cause for this turning point in government. For this reason, more research needs to be done to find out whether the church asylum reinforced The Hague's international profile as a city of Peace and Justice.

3. Methodology

For this dissertation, desk research has been carried out. Qualitative research yields more in-depth information with more details than quantitative research. In short, used sources include academic sources, institutional sources, official governmental, municipal and local documents of the city of The Hague, journalistic sources and three conducted interviews.

Primary sources have been applied for this dissertation. In order to gain a better understanding of the effects the church asylum posed on society, three semi-structured interviews were conducted with the most important stakeholders of the event. These include Sibel Kilinc, program manager international profiling for The Hague's Department of City Branding. This interview was conducted to get her opinion on the city of The Hague's contribution to church asylum. It was discussed whether improvement was made to the international position of The Hague by means of media coverage. Additionally, an interview was conducted with theologian Maaïke Harmsen as she was the last person to preach at the Bethel church before the asylum ended for the family. In her last sermon, she spoke on the topic 'Justice and Peace', which is closely related to the research question of this dissertation. The last stakeholder is John van Tilborg, managing director of INLIA. This organization has investigated the Tamrazyan family's file. Furthermore, they prepared the entire report for the State Secretary. Both with regard to the safety situation in Armenia and with regard to the application of the children's pardon.

The stakeholders were chosen based on their relevance and contribution to the church asylum period of October 2018 till February 2019. The interviews were conducted at the Hague city hall, in Katwijk and in Rijswijk. The meetings lasted approximately 25-40 minutes each. The answers that were given were recorded, and written by note-taking, with consent.

Furthermore, several brief meetings with employees of the municipality of The Hague were organized to get an idea of whether they believe that the church asylum strengthened justice and peace in The Hague. The brief meetings lasted 5 minutes and were mostly conducted with the employees of the International Affairs Department. The last primary source that was carried out were several telephone communications with NGOs related to the topic of (church) asylum. This could be done on the account of the International Affairs Department, the client of this dissertation, as they are the account holder of all the I(N)GOs in The Hague. The NGOs that were contacted were INLIA, STEK, Stichting Vluchteling, VluchtelingenWerk Den Haag, and Defence for Children. The telephone calls, of approximately 10 minutes each, were done to get the opinion of the members on the church

asylum and to find out whether they contributed to the desired result of the church result. The answers that were given were needed to have more data for the fourth sub-question of this research, "which NGOs in The Hague contributed to the desired result of the church shelter?".

As the subject of this dissertation recently took place, mainly news articles and the conducted interviews have been used. The articles were both from Dutch newspapers as from abroad. International newspapers include the CNN, the BBC, the Telegraph, the Guardian and Euronews. Additionally, interesting books on the topic of asylum combined with religion/sanctuary were analysed. The books related to church asylum were the books of Rabben (2016) 'Sanctuary and Asylum: A Social and Political History', Snyder (2012) 'Asylum-Seeking, Migration and Church', and Mitchell & Macfarlane (2018) 'The Sanctuary Network'. The most important books related to religion and peacebuilding were Smock (2006) 'Religious Contributions to Peace-making', Johnston (2005) 'The Religious Dimension of Peacebuilding' and Funk (2011) 'Religion and Peace and Conflict Studies'. The books were mostly selected if the authors wrote about either church asylum, national asylum policies and peacebuilding. This could easily be selected through the use of, for instance, Google Scholar. Moreover, Jstor, Muse and Archive.org have also been used to find relevant articles and/or books on this topic.

Finally, as the dissertation was assigned by the International Affairs Department of The Hague, an internal database (Werknet) has also been used to find published statements of the municipal council. These databases were useful as they provided reliable journals and scientific information.

Abovementioned resources made it possible to conclude this dissertation.

4. Results

4.1. Protected by Justice

According to the Tamrazyan family their “rescue” is due to all the people who realised that there was some form of injustice (Huisman, 2019). The Dutch Children’s Pardon stated that families have the right to stay in The Netherlands after five years (Rutte et al., 2017, p.54). This was not assigned to the Tamrazyan family by the judiciary when they applied after five years (Van Tilborg, personal communication, April 2019). Many people and institutions stood up for their right to the children’s pardon and the Bethel church decided to shelter them to send a signal to the government. The family was protected by justice, but the exact way in which the church guaranteed justice and security for the family is explained in this paragraph.

Initially, the Tamrazyan family was cared for by the Reformed Liberated Church in Katwijk, a village located close to The Hague (Huisman, 2018). The family stayed there for a few weeks. That church did not see the potential in organizing a continuous church service, that would last 24 hours a day, to protect the family because they did not have the right resources (Houten, 2018). The church was too small and too afraid that the police would come in between. The family was being transferred to the Bethel Church in The Hague. This church offered shelter to the Armenian family Tamrazyan from 26 October 2018 till 30 January 2019 (De Fijter, 2019). The Church made use of a certain Dutch law. To be precise, it was based on the General Act on Entry established in 1997, of which article 12b, reads:

In cases where the entry of places is permitted under a legal prescription, this shall not take place outside the case of discovery in the act of committing: ... in the space reserved for religious or reflective meetings of a philosophical nature, during the worship or reflection meeting (art. 12.b Wet op Binnentreden 1997).

According to this Dutch law, the Bethel Church is seen as a religious space and because of the ongoing worship meeting that was initiated, it was almost impossible for the authorities to interrupt. According to Teunis van Kooten, a lawyer specialized in law and religion, the church has moved within the limits of the legal order. Although the temporary use of the act of entry was not intended for these kinds of events, and the authorities could invade, it helped the family in this situation to fight for justice (Houten, September 2019).

Additionally, the family was protected by the norms and values of the Bethel Chapel itself. According to the Christian believe, the Bible makes justice a mandate of faith. Kees Kraayenoord, pastor of the fastest growing church in The Netherlands “De Mozaiek”, stated

that in practical terms, justice is seeking God and loving the people around you (Houtman, 2017). It means standing up for the weak in society in any form whatsoever to hinder injustice - whether it is human trafficking, persecution, economic exploitation or human rights violations. This is exactly what the church did: they offered safe shelter to a family in need. "It's safe here, that's the most important thing for us," says Hayarpi Tamrazyan. "When I go to sleep, there is a service going on. And when I wake up, the service is still busy. That gives a wonderful feeling of security" (Huisman, 2019). This quote of the 21-year-old Hayarpi give little hints about the safety conditions inside the Bethel Church. Additionally, the mayor of The Hague stated that the family did not have to fear eviction from the government (De Jonge, 2018). This also contributed to feeling secure.

Eventually, the purpose of the shelter was to stretch time and to appeal to the Dutch government. Specifically, for a reassessment of the many families based on the children's pardon. According to the children's pardon, families are entitled to a residence permit after five years (Rutte et al., 2017, p.54). The family applied for asylum in the Netherlands in 2010 because, they said, the father was in danger due to his political activities in Armenia. The judiciary ruled in favour of the family's residence permit, but the Dutch State appealed. In 2016, the Dutch State stated that they were not entitled to a residence permit. The family then applied for the children's pardon (Huisman, 2018, para.13). Former State Secretary Teeven explained the children's pardon in a letter from the government: "There are children who have been living in the Netherlands for many years, with no prospect of a residence permit. The long duration of the stay is due to procedures that sometimes took a long time in the past, non-cooperation with departure and stacking of procedures by parents, or a combination of these factors. In order to prevent these young people from being victimized by this, the government has decided to make a definitive arrangement and a transitional arrangement under which these youngsters can, under certain conditions, still be eligible for a residence permit". This was the explanation of the children's pardon to which the current coalition (Rutte III) has decided to continue to support.

According to Huisman, the criteria for this ruling are so strict that hardly a child receives a residence permit on that basis (Huisman, 2018, para.14). The Monitor agreed upon this and stated that there are two possible solutions. The children's pardon needs to be expanded or the families need to return to their country (Loosdregt, 2017). Van Tilborg, the managing director of INLIA, stated that it was not difficult to find out that the Tamrazyan family had right to apply for the children's pardon (Van Tilborg, personal communication, April 2019).

Bethel's church second goal was therefore to get a residence permit for the Tamrazyan family. The organization INLIA researched the background of the family and investigated whether the family was entitled to the children's pardon. The organization found out that the Tamrazyan children did fall under the children's pardon. This meant that they should be entitled to a residence permit after the pre-arranged period of five years. INLIA also found out that after five years and nine months, the family's application got rejected and after more rejections, deportation was the pronounced judgement of the judiciary (Van Tilborg, personal communication, April 2019). Theologian Maaïke Harmsen stated that Dutch judiciary made the right decisions, but in this case the Tamrazyan family was opposed by the Dutch State (Harmsen, personal communication April 2019).

The church's goals were achieved on 29 January 2019 when the four coalition parties decided that the entire current group, consisting of more than 1,000 children, would be reassessed. Hundreds of children and their families, who had been living between hope and fear for years, were told that they could definitely stay in the Netherlands. In fact, the expectation was that about 90 percent of them would be allowed to stay. On 30 January 2019, the church asylum organizers concluded that the church asylum would no longer be necessary (Bhagwat, 2019). The family could walk outside freely and continue to build a life in The Netherlands. According to political leader, Gert-Jan Segers, it is a miracle that the coalition approved his proposal (De Boer, Zuidervaat, 2019). The situation inside the church sometimes seemed like an endless prayer, an endless service in which believers and doubters have started to sing, pray and hope. Moreover, the church shelter was an example of what the Bible calls "the foolishness of the gospel", because "what can a few praying, singing, preaching, listening people do?", according to Segers (2019). Bethel church believed that God could make the impossible possible, and for them, the government's message came as a miracle, as a prayer being answered. Politicians from other political parties also responded to Bethel's church asylum. Jesse Klaver, political leader of *Groenlinks*, gave a "big applause" to the church service. Martijn Balster, The Hague's *PvdA*, stated that: "The Hague has shown in a fantastic way what it stands for: peace and children's justice" (Bhagwat, 2019).

In short, Bethel chapel ensured justice by providing a safe environment for the family during their stay of more than four months. By temporarily applying the aforementioned Dutch Act on Entry to enable the government to reassess family rights on the basis of the children's pardon. According to those involved in the church shelter, justice prevailed because not only the Tamrazyan family was entitled to a residence permit, but more families could follow.

4.2. Churches United

In recent years, the church has almost always been put down negatively in the news due to various scandals, internal fighting or humiliating statements to the public (Van Houten, 2018). Moreover, the number of believers and non-believers used to be in balance, but that has changed in the year 2019. According to the Central Agency for Statistics, the number of non-believers has exceeded the number of believers. "Church leavers" have often indicated unpleasant experiences in the church or unfair treatment as the reason (Van Houten, 2018). The shelter of Bethel Church showed that churches from different denominations could actually work together without being in direct opposition to each other. This part of the research will focus on how the church shelter strengthened the unity between the participating Christian church denominations and the influence of shared goals.

As reported by Fokkema, pastor of the Protestant church, a total of 2,326 hours of church service took place during the period of the church shelter. Moreover, nearly 150 volunteers, 12,000 visitors and almost a thousand pastors attended the celebrations. Among those Dutch visitors and pastors, there were also some from Switzerland, Germany, France, Italy, Belgium and from the United States (Fokkema, 2019). These many contributors had to cooperate to accomplish the afore-set goals of Bethel Chapel: to get attention for the Dutch children's pardon and a residence permit for the Tamrazyan family.

The thousands of people involved in the process were not unanimously part of one particular church movement. The many pastors, visitors and volunteers were divided among 80-100 different denominations. In the Christian sense of the word, a denomination is a religious entity with a common name, religious tradition, structure and/or doctrine (Huisman, 2019). According to theologian Maaïke Harmsen, the largest churches involved were the GKV, the PKN, the NGK and the CGK. Most of these denominations are the reformed branches of Christianity. The church asylum also started at the GKV in Katwijk. Thereafter, the church transferred the case to the PKN in The Hague. Maaïke Harmsen stated that this alone shows that different church denominations wanted to work together (Harmsen, personal communication April 2019). Furthermore, the case of the Tamrazyan family has also been discussed at the Missionary Platform the Hague and at the Council of Churches the Hague. Both the Platform and the Council are established to connect different churches in The Hague. For instance, seventeen churches in The Hague are part of the Platform and believe that it is "a blessing for the city when a diversity of churches work together" (Bakker, n.d.).

Outside the protestant or reformed church denominations, the Catholic church has opted for silent diplomacy as they made the choice not to take the lead during services. This resulted in an improved relationship between the Catholic church and the PKN in The Hague. Finally, mosques and synagogues have also visited and supported the services. Instead of focusing on each other's differences, they decided to work together. One of the reasons why this could be achieved was because of Bethel Chapel's clear goals. Moreover, these goals were shared and supported by other churches as well.

It has been proven when people are working for a shared goal, they put aside their differences and join forces to reach the common goal. Locke and Latham continue to state that it is essential to have a common goal to achieve effective cooperation between different parties. The common goal binds and connect (Locke, Latham, 2002, p.706). The two researchers found out that goals affect performances through several mechanisms. The goals of The Hague's church asylum focused attention toward goal-relevant activities and away from goal-irrelevant activities. Goals serve as an energizer: Higher goals induce greater effort, while low goals induce lesser effort (Locke, Latham, 2002, p.707). The goal of the church was not only to get a residence permit for the Tamrazyan family, but also to raise awareness for the injustices of the Dutch children's pardon.

Lastly, the goals affected persistence; constraints with regard to resources affect work pace (Locke, Latham, 2002, p.708). The church was dependent on people, twenty-four hours a day as they sheltered the family through a marathon service. It was clear for the church that they needed the people. The risk was that the resources would deplete, but even pastors from abroad wanted to contribute to this clear goal.

As mentioned by Maaïke Harmsen, the church asylum did not only increase the harmony within the variety of church denominations, it increased in the entire city of The Hague (Harmsen, personal communication, April 2019). Psychologist dr. David Smock confirms this. He reported that a situation in which different organizations work together peacefully to achieve a goal also increases the feeling of peace in the city (Smock, 2006). This was noticeable in The Hague (Huisman, 2019). For instance, there have been no protests or demonstrations and local residents have not been troubled by nuisance of the Bethel Chapel. Instead, many residents of the city have visited the services and contributed to the goal of the church (Harmsen, personal communication, April 2019).

In short, the Christian churches united as there was a clear mission and vision by the afore-set goals of Bethel's Chapel. The people involved in the church asylum process agree that it did not only bring harmony between the participating church denominations, but it also contributed to the overall harmony in the city of The Hague.

4.3. Supporting NGOs

Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) can help to address and solve a certain issue in society. In the case of the Tamrazyan family, citizens have taken the initiative to seek shelter in a church. That help has been offered to them by the church, but there are also various organizations that have contributed to the desired result of the church shelter. These organizations are referred to as non-governmental organizations (NGOs). The various NGOs have played an important role in bringing the human rights issue of the family to the attention of the local, national and international community. The most important NGOs that played a role in the Tamrazyan case are INLIA, STEK and Defence for Children. The contribution of these NGOs is described in more detail in this section.

According to dr. Douglas Johnston, NGOs are a component of religion and peace building. The President of the International Centre for Religion and Diplomacy points out that NGOs, and in particular faith-based NGOs (FBOs), offer two clear benefits. The first advantage is that FBOs have immediate influence within a community, because they are often located locally (Johnston, 2005, p.209). He reports that "it is very important to promote the ownership of conflict prevention and peace building initiatives as early as possible in the process" (Johnston, 2005, p. 210). The second benefit Johnston writes about is that FBOs have moral authority that contributes to the admissibility of negotiations and policies for peace (Johnston, 2005, p. 214).

Furthermore, NGOs monitor governments and encourage them to comply with human rights principles. In the case of the Tamrazyan family, the NGOs wanted to address the issue of children's rights. According to Defence for Children, the deportation of rooted children is a serious violation of those children's rights (Goeman, 2019). It is an issue that needs to be solved. Martine Goeman, the program manager of Children's Rights and Migration of Defence for Children, stated that "the time has come for The Hague to listen to the voice of the children and the voice of society. We will continue to fight with schools, churches and mayors for the recognition of the rights of the child. Five years of residence insecurity is long enough" (Goeman, 2019). She continues with stating that, Defence for Children admires the challenge the Bethel church has taken on. However, the NGO finds it unfortunate that these kind of actions are necessary in today's society (Goeman, 2018, para. 3). Defence for Children provides information and legal advice to children, young people, parents, teachers, lawyers, care providers and other stakeholders. The organization mediates if advice alone is not sufficient. For this, the organization can use

their network to contact other institutions, social workers and other experts. Defence for Children also prepares legal children's rights report to support procedures.

Another important organisation is STEK, the foundation for The Hague city and church. It is an organisation that wants to encourage people to connect with each other and to protect each other, to reinforce and inspire each other. For this purpose, STEK has a wide range of projects in The Hague and the surrounding area. The projects are initiated to support people to bring them into contact with each other. STEK also works for various clients, of which the Municipality of The Hague and the Protestant Church the Hague. The church asylum would not be there if it was not for STEK. The Bethel Chapel and Community Centre, where the Tamrazyan family took refuge, is a project of STEK. Furthermore, the department manager of STEK, Derk Stegeman, was the coordinator and spokesman of the church asylum in The Hague (Bhagwat, 2019).

Another NGO that also contributed to the church shelter in The Hague is INLIA. The organisation stands for the International Network of Local Initiatives with Asylum seekers. It is a network organization of religious communities that help asylum seekers and refugees in need (INLIA, 2018). According to the managing director of INLIA, John van Tilborg, the organisation was involved in the conversation prior to the arrival of the Tamrazyan family in The Hague. At that time, INLIA already had discussions with several churches in The Hague, Katwijk, Amsterdam and Kampen. Additionally, the organisation STEK was involved as well. Eventually, the Bethel Chapel decided to shelter the Tamrazyan family. Then, INLIA was involved in the discussions, consideration and choices that the Bethel Chapel had to make prior to the arrival of the family.

During the church asylum in The Hague, the organisation prepared the report for the State Secretary Harbers. Both with regard to the safety situation of the family and with regard to the application of the children's pardon. The extensive correspondence with the State Secretary was done in coordination with the Tamrazyan family, the Bethel church, the lawyers, STEK and others involved. Furthermore, file research was done into the Tamrazyan family. This included extensive research in the family's country of origin. To be able to do that, a mission has been sent to Armenia by INLIA for further investigation into their history. Additionally, legal file research has been done in The Netherlands with a number of INLIA's lawyers. The outcome of the research was used for both the substantive legal file and the children's pardon file concerning the Tamrazyan family. In the end, a final

note was written by INLIA about the case with the cooperation of the Bethel church and the Tamrazyan family (Van Tilborg, April 2019, personal communication).

The descriptions above show that NGOs can contribute to a solution to social issues within a society. The different NGOs can have influence inside a local community. Moreover, they can use their authority to stimulate negotiations on peace policy issues and human rights. In this case, different NGOs such as INLIA and STEK have worked to guarantee children's rights in the city of The Hague.

4.4. International Publicity

Both social media and regular media have become indispensable for today's society. It is unavoidable since the media can be seen, heard and read every day. Social media in particular has gotten a major influence on contemporary society. Social media gives the possibility that every person can send out a message that can be heard and amplified immediately by thousands or millions of others. The same goes for the Bethel church asylum in The Hague. If it was not for the media, the news could not have spread as quickly as in this case. For instance, it ensured that people outside the Netherlands have come to support the asylum. This chapter further examines how the media contributed to the strengthened positioning of the municipality of The Hague.

The specific case of the Tamrazyan family was not the only case in the Netherlands that caused media attention concerning the children's pardon. Thousands of articles have been published and even more discussions have started via the media about the children's pardon. A specific case that gave hope to the Tamrazyan family again was that of Lili and Howick (Huisman, 2019). It was about the two asylum children who were not deported to Armenia after all. After weeks of media attention, State Secretary Mark Harbers decided to use his power to deviate from the rules. This allowed the children Howick (12) and Lili (11) to stay in the Netherlands at the last minute (Klomp, 2018). After this, the children of the Tamrazyan family and many others had expected that the political party *ChristenUnie* would be committed to the future of the other estimated four hundred asylum children that stayed in the Netherlands for over five years. This was not the case according to Hayapri Tamrazyan (Huisman, 2019).

After all the media attention of Lili and Howick, the Dutch coalition was certainly not waiting for another wave of publicity according to children's right advocate, Esther van Dijken. The political groups, including the *ChristenUnie*, have explicitly asked the Tamrazyan family and their sympathizers to avoid publicity, says Van Dijken (Huisman, 2019). This was confirmed by the managing director of INLIA, Van Tilborg, as he stated that the case of the Tamrazyan family has been specifically chosen not to be too confrontational in the media. Partly, to not to confront the State Secretary (Van Tilborg, April 2019, personal communication). Thus, in general terms, to avoid the confrontation, but above all to call attention to the children's pardon.

The Hague Municipality was not actively involved in the process as well. Program Manager of International Profiling of The Hague's City Branding Bureau, Sibel Kilinc, says that this

is mainly due to the fact that the church asylum was a national issue, which makes it politically charged. In those cases, the Municipal Council reports less pronounced statements when it comes to national politics. According to Kilinc, it is not the main role of the municipality to be for or against something. Therefore, The Hague's City Branding did not actively monitor the church asylum (Kilinc, April 2019, personal communication).

Although silent diplomacy was chosen by several Dutch politics and the Dutch media, countless messages and statements of support were published (Huisman, 2019). Moreover, thousands of news items were published in national, but especially in international media. For instance, the story has been published in the O Globo Brazil, Tempo Indonesia, New York Times, Washington Post, CNN, BBC, The Guardian, The Independence, Die Zeitung, Pan Armenian, France24, China Today, Euronews and Irish Times. It shows the widespread. It shows that the case has been spread to different parts of the world. Moreover, it has been an interaction between the different aforementioned classic media (BBC, NY Times, etc.) and the spread on social media (mostly Twitter). The international publicity put even more pressure on the case, says INLIA's managing director (Van Tilborg, April 2019, personal communication). Theologian Maaike Harmsen reported that it was the international media attention, especially in the English-speaking world, that caused the church to publish an official statement of the asylum in English as well. Harmsen believes that the church shelter could not have survived without all the media attention. The attention was motivating, kept the goal alive and attracted many visitors and preachers who could contribute to the marathon service (Harmsen, April 2019, personal communication).

The international media attention contributes to the brand of the city of The Hague, says Sibel Kilinc. The Hague's brand is an association of individuals. In other words, City Branding is striving to get the right association of The Hague into the mind of a certain group of people (Municipal Council, 2015, p.3). The right association contributes to a better position of The Hague on an international level. In this case, people from abroad make the association of The Hague as a city that protected people in need. Moreover, those interested even want to visit and have visited the Hague to get the "full experience" (Kilinc, April 2019, personal communication). The right association with, interest in, and visits to The Hague contribute to a better positioning of the city of The Hague.

The international media attention did not only ensure that people from abroad visited the church in the Netherlands. It also ensured that those involved in the church shelter are

invited abroad. For example, coordinator and spokesperson for the church shelter, Derk Stegeman, visited Edinburg in March at the invitation of Eurodiaconia. It is a European network of churches and Christian NGOs that provide social and health services and advocate social justice. Eurodiaconia's members represent the needs and experiences of 50 national and regional organisations in 32 countries (La Mantia, n.d.). Stegeman was invited to talk about the church shelter at their annual conference (Stegeman, 2019).

In addition, the chairman of the Hague Protestant Church, Theo Hettema, is invited to speak about the church asylum at a conference in Germany. More interviews, lectures and speaking opportunities abroad will follow according to Derk Stegeman (Stegeman, 2019).

Although the Dutch media opted for silent diplomacy, the church asylum was widely spread in the news. It did not only contribute to the desired result of the church, but it also placed The Hague on the map. It showed that the inhabitants of the city of Peace and Justice pay attention to advocate social justice and children's rights.

4.5. City Branding

The Municipality of The Hague is also known as the city of Peace and Justice. This title of the city is also called the 'brand of The Hague'. To promote and strengthen that specific brand on a national and international level, a special Bureau has been set up within the municipality. This section discussed the definition of The Hague brand and how this brand can be monitored in practice.

The City Branding Bureau reports that the history of The Hague as an international city of Peace and Justice goes back to the first international Hague Peace Conferences of 1899 and 1907. The history of these conferences and the construction of the Peace Palace also ensure a connection between the Hague's position and the international profile of Peace and Justice (Kilinc, April 2019, personal communication). Being a city of Peace and Justice has put The Hague on the map internationally and is for many organisations, companies, knowledge institutions, students and congresses an important reason to come to the city (Municipal Council, 2015, p.4). It gives the city an international stature, with a great diversity of international residents.

The Hague is also called the capital of law. The city is widely known for maintaining the international legal order that The Netherlands has in its constitution (Schrijver, 2010, p.210). The Hague embodies that with the institutions that are being linked to Peace and Justice, such as the Permanent Court of Arbitration and later the International Court of Justice. From the top of the municipal administration around the beginning of the 90s, involvement in the recruitment of new international (legal) organizations was shown. The arrival of new organizations ensured visas versa that the development of a city image was stimulated (Klappe-Linsen, 2018). Examples are the Iran-US Claims Tribunal, the Yugoslavia Tribunal, the OPCW and the International Criminal Court. In addition to various intergovernmental organizations, specific European organizations were also set up and based in The Hague, such as Europol and Eurojust. The city is also home to around one hundred non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in the city (Klappe-Linsen, 2018). Almost all international organisations and institutions in The Hague have a link with the brand of Peace and Justice (Kilinc, April 2019, personal communication).

As mentioned before, the City Branding Bureau has been set up to promote and strengthen the brand of Peace and Justice. In practice, the Bureau coordinates the city marketing policy of the municipality of The Hague. City Branding is currently working on the implementation of the Hague City branding 2020 approach adopted by the city council on

17 December 2015 (Municipal Council, 2015). To achieve this, close collaboration with external parties in the city is mandatory. The Bureau's aim is to make the city more attractive and to ensure that people, companies and organizations choose The Hague to visit or settle earlier and more often. This stimulates the economy and employment in The Hague (DSO, n.d.). As mentioned in the previous chapter 'International Publicity', the church asylum also caused a great deal of interest from abroad (Huisman, 2019). It resulted into people doing research into The Hague and some even visiting The Hague to support the action of the church (Stegeman, 2019). Program Manager of International Profiling of The Hague's City Branding Bureau, Sibel Kilinc, stated that the Bureau did not actively monitor and/or promote the church asylum. Especially since it was a politically sensitive issue that the municipality was not supposed to interfere with (Kilinc, April 2019, personal communication).

Kilinc also mentioned that City Branding does focus on issues within the city that impact the municipality as a whole. In practice, City Branding is not only focussed on what the Bureau undertakes, but it also supports citizens' initiatives. The goal of the Bureau is to get a city that naturally undertakes actions and/project where the core values of The Hague's brand are expressed (DSO, n.d.). These values include 'binding' and 'unlimited'. Kilinc is convinced that the church asylum within the city of The Hague is a good example of a citizens' initiative where the core values of the city came forward. Eventually, the Hague's brand is there to motivate people in the city to apply it in practice. The church asylum was a type of action where local cooperation and NGOs were involved that underlined the values of the city (Kilinc, April 2019, personal communication).

At the same time, the City Branding Bureau is also trying to explain more about what they mean by building a better world. The city is known for its brand Peace and Justice on which The Hague's brand is built. The definition goes back in history and, therefore, constantly needs an up-to-date translation. Actions such as the church asylum promote the brand in the needs of today's society. Moreover, it can be linked to building a better world (Kilinc, April 2019, personal communication). According to the Municipal report, The Hague is becoming more and more a unique meeting and cooperation place for government leaders, judges, knowledge institutions, social organizations, the business community and students (Municipal Council, 2015, p.8). In the coming years, the city branding office will focus on strengthening the identity of the city of peace and justice. Moreover, monitoring the current developments. Especially, when the world is currently full of conflicts arising from terrorism, migration, scarcity of resources and climate change (DSO, n.d.). The Municipal Council

state that in the Hague, “these conflicts must not only be settled legally, but the city must also be the meeting place for devising solutions to these complex international issues” (Municipal Council, 2015, p.10).

In short, the City Branding Bureau monitors The Hague's brand of Peace and Justice through various means. On the one hand, clear strategies and policies have been developed to guarantee The Hague's brand. It is a brand that is based on rich history and therefore must constantly be updated and translated into the issues of the 21st century. At the same time, City Branding stimulates independent local initiatives that also strengthen the brand. The church asylum of The Hague is an example of an initiative that has strengthened the brand in its own way.

5. Discussion

The results above show that the Bethel's church asylum has provided a residence permit for not only the Tamrazyan family, but many similar family cases in the Netherlands. This has been achieved through the cooperation of the family, the (inter)national publicity on social media, the involvement of many churches, volunteers, the NGOs and eventually the government. In the theoretical framework, the research gap on the topic of church asylum was identified; the specific case of the Tamrazyan family who found sanctuary in Bethel's Chapel. The main question is whether the Bethel's chapel sanctuary contributed to The Hague's international profile of peace and justice. The connection between asylum-seekers and church sanctuary has already been discussed by many researchers. The most important ones can be found in the theoretical framework. However, the connection between church sanctuary and the international profile of peace and justice is unique. Thus, after having provided the theoretical framework and outlined the methodological approach, this chapter is focused on the analysis of the peace and justice debates regarding the church asylum.

According to Cambridge Dictionary, peace is a situation in which there is "freedom from war and violence. Especially, when people live and work together happily without disagreements" (Cambridge Dictionary, n.d.). Peace is defined in positive terms and is associated most with "free". As known from the results the Tamrazyan family fled Armenia to seek refuge in The Netherlands in 2010. There was no peace or harmony because of a political conflict in Armenia. After having stayed in The Netherlands for eight years, the family received the news that it was safe in Armenia again and that they could return. The deportation news was the beginning of a discussion: was it just to send the family back to their country of origin or was it the right thing to let them stay?

The Bethel church believed the latter and took the family in. In this situation, the family was being protected by Bethel's church asylum. During the sanctuary, the Tamrazyan family lived and worked together peacefully with many people and organizations. As reported in the results, there were no protests or demonstrations in the surroundings of the Bethel Chapel. This meant that local residents have not been troubled by the Bethel's church asylum. In fact, many local residents of The Hague have visited the church services. This good cooperation between the many different churches, people and NGOs resulted in an increasing association of peace in the city of The Hague. The international reporting on social media on the Bethel's church asylum also resulted in an increased association of

people abroad with The Hague and peacebuilding. For many people it was an unjust situation in which a church in The Hague 'came to the rescue' (Huisman, 2019).

The connection between peacebuilding and 'an unjust situation' shows that the concepts of peace and justice are intertwined. *Justice* is defined as the "fairness in the way people are dealt with" (Cambridge Dictionary, n.d.). The ongoing discussion to which this chapter focuses is what just policy contains with regard to refugees who have remained in The Netherlands despite a rejection but are rooted after five years. After having analysed the results, it can be said that the Tamrazyan case shows a radical difference of opinion as to what is a fair approach to the issue of illegally staying rooted refugees. There are two sides to this discussion. On one hand, there is a perspective that can be defined as the "rules are rules". On the other hand, there is the "merciful perspective". Both sides have the same desire; to seek justice.

In the "rules are rules" approach, the emphasis is on the initial rejection of the refugee's residence permit. The argument is simple: the refugee had the opportunity to obtain a permit within the rules of an asylum procedure, and that failed. The refugee must now follow the consequence; deportation. Those who invoke the rules of the system must also adhere to the consequences. In the "merciful perspective" in the discussion about refugees, the focus shifts from the rules to the upbringing of the refugee. The status holder may not have complied with the rules, but the fact is that he (and/or his children) has ties with the society of the country where he has been living for many years. Those ties cannot be denied and undoing someone from what has now become his own environment is unjust. Viewed in this way, the position of "rules are rules" underlines its idea of justice at the time of the rejection of the asylum application. At that moment someone had their chance which can succeed or fail. The merciful perspective, on the other hand, focuses on the moment in the present, while the stranger is rooted.

It is clear from the aforementioned data that the Bethel Chapel followed the "merciful perspective" when they took the family in. However, both sides can also be applied to the Dutch Cabinet. The VVD stands for the "rules-are-rules" as the party does not want to reward people who do not comply with the rules. On the other hand, the Christenunie believes in the "merciful perspective". They are convinced that it is unjust to deport families when they are rooted. There is no good or wrong in this discussion. It is fact that the Tamrazyan family was rejected when they applied for a residence permit. It is also proven that a family is rooted after a period of five years. It shows a much greater concern. A concern that affects the Dutch system regarding refugees. It is visible that both sides

simplify the demand for a just admission policy in order to be able to determine a clear order in which this problem can be solved. In this way, status holders should be helped faster and more clearly in their residence permit's application. The discussion should therefore not focus on where the refugee was wrong, but where the Dutch procedure has its flaws.

It shows that justice - the fairness in the way people are dealt with - can be interpreted in different ways. The decision as to what is the right side lies with the reader. It is clear that the discussions concerning the asylum seekers and the Tamrazyan family have devoted more attention to the concept of *justice* in the city of The Hague.

In short, the concept of peace and justice cannot be easily measured. It is mainly about having the correct association with it, according to the City Branding Bureau. One thing is certain about this case: it has ensured good cooperation. Moreover, it caused international attention and eventually a snowball effect for all other asylum-seeking families in the Netherlands. At least, those who have applied for the children's pardon. Ultimately, the church shelter can be one of the most important causes for the change in Dutch politics regarding the children's pardon. Thus, the Tamrazyan family, together with Bethel's Chapel, the NGOs and all others involved, have ensured that more families can stay in the Netherlands. For many in The Hague, and beyond, that was achieving peace and justice.

6. Conclusion

The research has shown that Bethel's Church asylum has started an ongoing discussion on the treatment of asylum-seekers in The Netherlands. The discussion was mostly about children's rights and the flaws in the Dutch application procedure of asylum-seekers. Most commotion was caused due to the fact that the family had lived in the Netherlands for such a long period of time, and especially the children. It would be 'unjust' to send the children back.

In the end, the goals of Bethel's church shelter were reached. Nevertheless, they got a residence permit for the Tamrazyan family and additionally, the church was also able to reach the Dutch government. However, the greater goal that was achieved by the church asylum was beyond expectations. The raised attention in Dutch politics eventually resulted in the fact that the coalition decided that other families in the Netherlands would have to be reassessed as well. This means that many asylum-seeking families, who applied for the children's pardon, will be allowed to stay in the Netherlands. This shows that Bethel's church shelter has had an enormous impact on society, but more importantly it changed the future of many children in the Netherlands.

Moreover, Bethel's church asylum also caused different church movements and NGOs to cooperate peacefully. It raised international publicity to the extent that people visited The Hague to witness and participate in the "mega-church" service that lasted 24 hours a day. The church asylum became a broad national movement. The factors ensured the City Branding's goal of promoting The Hague's brand of peace and justice successfully. Many people got the chance to create a positive association with the city of The Hague. In short, it is safe to assume that the Bethel church asylum contributed to The Hague's international profile of peace and justice.

7. Recommendation

The Bethel church asylum illustrates the need in Dutch society to do something about the asylum policy. Individual cases - such as the Tamrazyan family - do ask attention for fact that better regulation is needed for asylum-seeking children and families in the Netherlands. Additionally, the Tamrazyan case recognizes the complexity of the Dutch application procedure for asylum-seekers. There are various ways to apply for a Dutch residence permit. If one way does not succeed, other ways can be tried. For this reason, the procedure should be made a little more transparent in which a clear sequence is indicated for those

seeking asylum. It is advisable to do more research into the possibilities of restructuring the application procedures for asylum-seekers.

The Bethel church asylum also showed Dutch society that church and state can complement each other peacefully. The separation between church and state does not have to be absolute. The Tamrazyan case showed that both institutions are needed. More cooperation between The Hague's most important churches and the municipality of The Hague on specific issues in the city of The Hague is advisable in the future. Just like the municipality of The Hague, the churches often work together with local organisations to strengthen the well-being of citizens. The city of The Hague will only benefit if both authorities were to join forces in the future.

More importantly, it is recommended for the International Affairs Department and the City Branding Bureau of the city of The Hague to monitor more actively on cases such as the Bethel church asylum. It should not only monitor the things that are organized from a top-down level, but also from the bottom-up approach. The goal of the municipality is eventually to get a city that naturally undertakes action where the core values of The Hague's brand are expressed. The Bethel church asylum is one example out of many locally organized actions where local cooperation underlines and strengthens the values of The Hague.

8. References

Art. 12.b Wet op Binnentreden (22 June 1997). Retrieved on 15 March 2019 from the government of the Netherlands:

<https://wetten.overheid.nl/jci1.3:c:BWBR0006763¶graaf=3&artikel=12&z=2010-07-01&q=2010-07-01>

Bakker, P. (n.d.). Missie en Visie. Retrieved on 16 April 2019 from the Missionair Platform Den Haag:

<http://missionairplatformdenhaag.nl>

Bhagwat, N. (30 January 2019). Kerkasiel voor Armeens gezin voorbij. Retrieved on 30 January 2019 from the AD:

<https://www.ad.nl/den-haag/kerkasiel-voor-armeens-gezin-voorbij~a142a7d5/>

Boffey, D. (21 December 2018). Sixty Day Church Service Keeps Hopes Alive for Asylum Family. Retrieved on 23 January 2019 from the Guardian:

<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/dec/21/dutch-round-the-clock-church-service-keeps-hopes-alive-for-asylum-family>

Boon, F. (23 December 2018). Het Kerkasiel geeft Haagse Protestanten Nieuw Vuur. Retrieved on 15 January 2019 from NRC:

<https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2018/12/23/het-kerkasiel-geeft-haagse-protestanten-nieuw-vuur-a3126943>

Bouwman, E. (28 November 2018). Verslag Werksessie BSD-I 2018. Retrieved on 30 November 2018 from the public disk of the International Affairs Department.

CBS (n.d.). Begrippen - Vluchteling & Asielzoekers. Retrieved on 9 May 2019 from the official website of Statistics Netherlands:

<https://www.cbs.nl/nl-nl/onze-diensten/methoden/begrippen?tab=v#id=vluchteling>

De Boer, M. & Zuidervaat, B. (2 February 2019). Joël Voordewind: Het kinderpardon was een lege huls geworden. Retrieved on 5 March 2019 from Trouw:

https://www.trouw.nl/democratie/joel-voordewind-het-kinderpardon-was-een-lege-hulsgeworden~a2d7b9ab/?fbclid=IwAR1XujVF53JREob0Tww_0vmYjHBUst0YREhbxkpizKLuF5-xTW2X1TzcOo0

De Fijter, N. (19 January 2019). CDA-draai over kinderpardon brengt dag van hoop in de Haagse Bethelkapel. Retrieved on 23 January 2019 from Trouw:

<https://www.trouw.nl/religie-en-filosofie/cda-draai-over-kinderpardon-brengt-dag-van-hoop-in-de-haagse-bethelkapel~afc2ccab/>

De Goede, A. (27 March 2019). Spanning stijgt bij honderden asielgezinnen: mogen ze blijven of niet? Retrieved on 24 April 2019 from RTL:

<https://www.rtlnieuws.nl/nieuws/politiek/artikel/4657001/kinderpardon-gezinnen-blijven-niet-spanning>

De Jonge, L. (31 October 2018). Armeens gezin in Bethel hoeft nog niet te vrezen voor ontruiming. Retrieved on 8 March 2019 from AD:

<https://www.ad.nl/den-haag/armeens-gezin-in-bethel-hoeft-nog-niet-te-vrezen-voor-ontruiming~a7352b8e/>

DSO (n.d.). Bureau City Branding. Retrieved on 18 April 2019 from the official website of the city of The Hague:

<https://www.denhaag.nl/nl/in-de-stad/ondernemen/bureau-citymarketing.htm>

Fokkema, E. (9 February 2019). Kerkasiel Bethel was veel meer dan een schuilplaats en herberg. Retrieved on 15 April 2019 from Friesch Dagblad:

https://frieschdagblad.nl/2019/2/9/kerkasiel-bethel-was-veel-meer-dan-een-schuilplaats-en-herberg?harvest_referrer=https:%2F%2Fwww.google.com%2F

Funk, N.C. & Woolner, C.J. (2011). Religion and Peace and Conflict Studies. In Matyok, T., Senehi, J., & Byrne, S. *Critical Issues in Peace and Conflict Studies*. Toronto: Lexington Books, 2011: p. 351-358.

Goeman, M. (26 October 2018). Marathonkerkdienst tegen uitzetting familie Hayarpi. Retrieved on 19 April 2019 from Defence for Children:

<https://www.defenceforchildren.nl/actueel/nieuws/migratie/2018/marathonkerkdienst-tegen-uitzetting-familie-hayarpi>

Goeman, M. (January 2019). Dossier: Kinderpardon. Retrieved on 19 April 2019 from Defence for Children:

<https://www.defenceforchildren.nl/wat-doen-we/dossiers/kinderpardon>

Grüll, C. (8 February 2019). Sanctuary and Public Space: Church Asylum and Kinderpardon in the Netherlands. Retrieved on 8 March 2019 from The University of Groningen:

<https://www.rug.nl/research/centre-for-religious-studies/religion-conflict-globalization/blog/sanctuary-and-public-space-church-asylum-and-kinderpardon-in-the-netherlands-08-02-2019>

Houtman, W. (2 February 2017). Kees Kraayenoord: 'Ik zou willen dat elke kerk groeit'.

Retrieved on 15 March 2019 from Nederlands Dagblad:

<https://www.nd.nl/nieuws/cultuur/kees-kraayenoord-ik-zou-willen-dat-elke-kerk.2491311.lynkx>

Houten, van M. (27 September 2018). Kerk in Katwijk ontfermt zich over uitgeprocedeerd gezin van Hayarpi. Retrieved on 5 April 2019 from Trouw:

<https://www.trouw.nl/samenleving/kerk-in-katwijk-ontfermt-zich-over-uitgeprocedeerd-gezin-van-hayarpi~ad41f2f8/>

Houten, van M. (22 October 2018). Religieuze Nederlanders zijn nu in de minderheid.

Retrieved on 15 April 2019 from Trouw:

<https://www.trouw.nl/religie-en-filosofie/religieuze-nederlanders-zijn-nu-in-de-minderheid~ad267a33/>

Houten, van M. (19 December 2018). Ontkerkelijkking slaat kraters in de samenleving.

Retrieved on 18 April 2019 from Trouw:

<https://www.trouw.nl/religie-en-filosofie/-ontkerkelijkking-slaat-kraters-in-de-samenleving-~a5e3aaa9/>

Huisman, C. (16 January 2019). Hoe de voortdurende kerkdienst voor het Armeense gezin Tamrazyan wereldnieuws werd. Retrieved on 15 March 2019 from de Volkskrant:

<https://www.volkskrant.nl/nieuws-achtergrond/hoe-de-voortdurende-kerkdienst-voor-het-armeense-gezin-tamrazyan-wereldnieuws-werd~b7a9216a/>

Huisman, C. (17 October 2018). Met uitzetting bedreigd Armeens gezin in Katwijk; “de kerk zorgt ontzettend goed voor ons”. Retrieved on 17 April 2019 from De Volkskrant:

<https://www.volkskrant.nl/nieuws-achtergrond/met-uitzetting-bedreigd-armeens-gezin-in-katwijk-de-kerk-zorgt-ontzettend-goed-voor-ons~bdfa2d01/>

INLIA (18 May 2018). 30-jarig bestaan Charter van Groningen. Retrieved on 15 March 2019 from INLIA:

<https://www.inlia.nl/nl/nieuws/901/30-jarig-bestaan-charter-van-groningen>

Johnston, D. (2005). Faith-Based Organizations: The Religious Dimension of Peacebuilding. In Van Tongeren, P. *People Building Peace II: Successful Stories of Civil Society*. CO, Boulder: Lynne Rienner, 2005: p. 209-218.

Justice [Def. 1]. (n.d.). Cambridge Dictionary Online. Retrieved on 6 May 2019 from the Cambridge Dictionary:

<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/justice>

Klappe-Linsen, L. (30 May 2018). Werkplan BSD-I 2018-2022. Retrieved on 23 April 2019 from the public disk of the International Affairs Department.

Klomp, C. (8 September 2018). Lili en Howick mogen blijven en zijn weer gevonden. Retrieved on 19 April 2019 from the AD:

<https://www.ad.nl/binnenland/lili-en-howick-mogen-blijven-en-zijn-weer-gevonden~ad10c1ad/>

Kompagnie, A. (19 January 2019). Armeens Gezin Tamrazyan Koestert weer Hoop. Retrieved on 23 January 2019 from the AD:

<https://www.ad.nl/den-haag/armeens-gezin-tamrazyan-koestert-weer-hoop~a37d8c14/>

La Mantia, A. (n.d.). Eurodiaconia - Mission, Goals and Network. Retrieved on 23 April 2019 from the official website of Eurodiaconia:

<https://www.eurodiaconia.org/who-we-are/mission-goals-and-networks/>

Locke, E.A., & Latham, G.P. (October 2002). Building a practically useful theory of goal setting and task motivation - A 35-year odyssey. In *American Psychologist*, 57 (9): p. 705-717.

Mitchell, K., & Macfarlane, K. (2018). The Sanctuary Network: Transnational Church Activism and Refugee Protection in Europe. In Mitchell, K., Jones, R., & Fluri, J. (eds.) *Handbook on Critical Geographies of Migration*. MA, United States: Edward Elgar Press, 2019.

Municipal Council (4 November 2015). Voorstel van het college inzake Aanpak Haagse Citybranding 2020. Retrieved on 18 April 2019 from the official website of the city of The Hague:
<https://denhaag.raadsinformatie.nl/modules/13/Overige%20bestuurlijke%20stukken/80154>

Peace [Def. 1] (n.d.). Cambridge Dictionary Online. Retrieved on 6 May 2019 from Cambridge Dictionary:
<https://dictionary.cambridge.org/dictionary/english/peace>

Rabben, L. 'Sanctuary and Asylum: A Social and Political History'. 1st ed. Washington, US: Washington Press, 2016.

Rutte, M., Buma, S., Pechtold, A. & Segers, G.J. (10 October 2017). Vertrouwen in de toekomst. Regeerakkoord 2017-2021. Retrieved on 5 April 2019 from Dutch Parliament:
https://www.parlement.com/id/vkidc8m3p1sz/kabinet_rutte_iii_2017

Schrijver, N. (28 July 2010). A Missionary Burden or Enlightened Self-Interest? International Law in Dutch Foreign Policy. In *Netherlands International Law Review*, 57 (2): p.209-244.

Shachar, A. 'The birthright lottery: Citizenship and global inequality'. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 2009.

Smock, D. R. 'Religious Contributions to Peacemaking'. In *Peaceworkers* No.55, Washington, US: United States, Institute of Peace, 2006.

Snyder, S. 'Asylum-Seeking, Migration and Church.' 1st ed. Oxford, UK: Taylor & Francis Ltd, 2012.

Stegeman, D. (1 April 2019). Kerkasiel Bethel. Retrieved on 19 April 2019 from the Protestantse Kerk Den Haag:

<https://www.vrijzinnigen.nl/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/nieuwsbrief.pdf>

Teeven, F. (7 January 2013). Regeling langdurig verblijvende kinderen [Letter of government]. Retrieved on 17 April 2019 from the Parlementaire Monitor:

<https://www.parlementairemonitor.nl/9353000/1/j9vvij5epmj1ey0/vj63n9iwsvzt>

9. Appendices

9.1. Transcript Interview Maaïke Harmsen, theologian

Harmsen, M. (1 April 2019). Personal Interview.

Dylan: First of all, thank you for your time today for an interview about the church asylum in The Hague. We have already exchanged a few things via e-mail about the background of my research. I will summarize the event briefly again. As you may already know, The Hague's Bethel Chapel and Community Centre offered shelter to the Armenian family Tamrazyan from 26 October 2018 till 30 January 2019. The church had decided to keep an uninterrupted service to protect the family from being deported. The church had two goals: to get attention for the children's pardon and to get a residence permit for this particular family. It was accomplished when the Dutch coalition parties decided that the entire current group of children being processed by the government. The Hague's church asylum has left a great impression on society. Not only on the municipality of The Hague but has also gathered attention worldwide. More research needs to be done to find out whether the church shelter has strengthened the international profile of The Hague as city of Peace and Justice. The assignment provider for this research is the International Affairs Department of The City of The Hague. Are you following me so far?

Maaïke: Yes, thank you for the background information once again.

Dylan: Good to hear. Before I forget, for my research I need a signature from you for the Informed Consent Form. In addition, I want to ask you if you have any objection that I record the interview with my voice recorder. Then I can work it out into a transcript. Is this ok with you?

Maaïke: Certainly, no problem!

Dylan: Perfect! Let's start. I would like to begin with the article of Trouw in which you are mentioned. On January 30, 2019, an article was published by Trouw in which it was written that you gave a sermon on Peace and Justice that same day. Could you briefly summarize that sermon?

Maaïke: I read through a bundle of Bible meditations. I have written a series of meditations about war and peace, so that Christians have the possibility to think about war and peace. Specifically, about The Hague's peace and justice. Additionally, we have talked about whether it is attainable to get peace and justice

here on earth. It was a statement from one of the prophets in the Bible who said that justice cannot be done without peace. Standing up for the strangers was part of that peace and being just to strangers is also part of the peace of Israel, thus eventually the world.

Dylan: Interesting. Have you consciously linked this larger concept to The Hague's profile of Peace and Justice?

Maaïke: Yes, definitely. It constantly makes you think about the image of The Hague as a city of Peace and Justice. It has a very biblical sound. I also read another meditation in which I spoke about the fact that there is peace in North Korea. However, that does not mean that there is justice. There is no war in that country. Until the moment you turn against society. There is a link with being just to everyone's way of life and form of government.

Dylan: Did you also see this connection in the Tamrazyan family's situation?

Maaïke: Yes, a city can only speak of true peace if justice is accomplished. What is striking is that for the churches and the Biblical prophets, justice is mainly done to the poor and people with a weaker position in society. God has also come for the orphans and the strangers: in short, people with a weaker position in society. There is a constant demand for the rich and the powerful to look after the orphaned and stand up for the weak. Others who are stronger must commit themselves to that group. That way, there will be real peace.

Dylan: Do you also think that the Municipality of The Hague should have more influence on this situation? Or: why did they not interfere in the situation?

Maaïke: As Christians, we have a certain goodwill factor in The Hague. However, imagine if this would have taken place in a mosque? That would be a totally different story. As far as I am concerned, the municipality of The Hague should talk together with the churches and mosques to see if this could happen more often. Do we still want this? Perhaps, but then the municipality should pay extra attention to the safety issue together. Especially if a mosque would do such an action. Furthermore, I had a little trouble providing a service under the "collateral blessing". Meaning that, people could just hide, while preachers fulfill a 24-hours service.

Teunis van Kooten, a lawyer who specializes in church law, indicated that the Dutch law of entry is not intended to shelter refugees. It is applicable in situations if, for example, a shoplifter disrupts a worship service. That shoplifter may only be arrested after the service's done. There is, of course, a difference between the shoplifter and the Tamrazyan family, who were just innocent in my opinion.

Dylan: If I understand correctly, the authorities could have disrupted the service. I believe this uncertainty was taken away in the church when the mayor of The Hague said that disrupting the worship service would not be a priority. Is that right?

Maaïke: True, it was not a priority. There also were no demonstrations in the church's surroundings. It is a normal residential street, but the residents did not notice the event, nor have they complained about it. Demonstrations could have been possible. I mean, sheltering refugees can of course cause unrest.

Dylan: Right, I understand. Now I would like to focus on the people who were joining the services. Is it true that you are part of the Morgensterkerk? The Reformed Church (Liberated) in The Hague. I also understand that you are in a steering group for the reunification of two church denominations. Is that correct?

Maaïke: Yes, that is right.

Dylan: Did you also see strengthened ties between other church denominations during the church shelter?

Maaïke: Certainly. One of our members of the GKV has been the coordinator of Bethel Church. I have seen alliances strengthen between the GKV, NGK and CGK. These are all reformed branches. Additionally, ties have been strengthened with protestant (PKN) and catholic churches in The Hague.

Dylan: I did not know. I also found some interesting facts. During the church shelter in Bethel, almost 150 volunteers, 12,000 visitors and nearly a thousand pastors from different denominations were involved in the celebrations. Do you know how many different denominations were represented?

Maaïke: I believe there were approximately 80-100 different denominations that worked together. Remarkably, few evangelical movements cooperated during the

church shelter. Many were members of the PKN and the GKV (900). Furthermore, CGK (500 members) and NGK (450).

Dylan: Those are big numbers. The church shelter is, of course, one of the examples in which cooperation was central, but there are also other stories in current society where churches clash. Do you believe that this action has also increased peace in the city? As well for non-religious residents?

Maaïke: Yes, certainly. We also had many visitors attending the services who fully supported it, but who were not religious. The only regulation during the asylum was that it was a church service. This meant that only Christians were allowed to lead the service. This was also accepted and received in good harmony by the non-believers or people who held different beliefs.

Dylan: All kinds of believers joint together to fight for one purpose, but I would like to know more about the fact that cooperation between different denominations and/or organizations got strengthened. Do you have more information for me on that matter?

Maaïke: I understand. We have The Hague's Missionary Platform and there's The Hague's Council of Churches that have discussed this event. The event was contagious; cooperation has indeed emerged. The GKV in Katwijk, for example, transferred the case to The Hague's PKN. This alone shows that they wanted to work together. GKV Katwijk has also visited the services several times. In addition, the Catholic Church has opted for silent diplomacy. They made the conscious choice not to take the lead during services, but to contribute on the background. Another party that opted for silent diplomacy was the Dutch political party CDA. Many PKN members are supporters of CDA and the board has discussed this with the fraction.

Dylan: Is this the reason why the CDA also suddenly decided to expand the children's pardon?

Maaïke: I think so, yes!

Dylan: Interesting. To return to your article in Trouw. Do you believe that the media has also contributed to the positive positioning of the municipality of The Hague and/or the desired result of the church?

Maaïke: Yes, I think so. Much has been written in English as well, which was closely followed by an English statement of the church shelter. I believe it has been a good interaction between social media (E.g. Twitter and Facebook) and classic media (such as BBC, CNN).

Dylan: Thank you. How many times have you visited the church asylum? Could you describe the Bethel's environment?

Maaïke: About eight times, of which I have spoken four times. I have experienced the environment as very peaceful and safe. Again, we have not acted outside the legal order during the asylum. We have moved within the limits of Dutch legal order. Meaning that we were within the limits of the law. It was a bit philosophical: was it within or outside the legal order? To me, it was within. It was a temporary use of the Dutch law of entry. Although the rule was not intended for it, and the authorities could have invaded, it helped the family in this situation to fight for justice. This was not the case in Katwijk. The AIVD, for example, entered a church in Katwijk which was very intimidating. This was also an extra motivation for me to commit to the family in The Hague. I am convinced that it should not be possible for authorities to just step into a church and intimidate people. That is just not right.

Dylan: If I understand correctly, the incident in Katwijk by the AIVD was one of your motives for participating in the church shelter in The Hague?

Maaïke: Yes, my main motive was to seek God and see God work. So, I finally saw the result as a prayer being answered. I also believe that social media, all the volunteers and the use of silent diplomacy have also contributed to Bethel's church asylum desired goals. However, God should ultimately have received all the credits. However, during the closing service, this was hardly mentioned. It was rightly mentioned by Hayarpi Tamrazyan, but for a long time the honor was given to the people who had helped. At the end, a final, cautious sentence was mentioned that seemed to give the glory to God.

Dylan: Do you see God's help as the main reason that justice has been able to prevail in the case of the Tamrazyan family?

Maaike: Certainly, and it should be mentioned first, especially if you have prayed to God for so many hours.

Dylan: The article in Trouw also questioned whether the church should act more often in nowadays' society. Your response in the article was that the first task of the church is to talk about the kingdom of God. Meaning that the church is neither a political party nor a refined neighborhood center.

Maaike: True, this church asylum was an exceptional situation with an exceptional group of children and one exceptional law that was not being implemented. The law, referring to the children's pardon, was meant to do justice to this group of children. Normally you let a judge make the decisions. In this case, I believe the group of children was opposed by these judges. The group was promised a residence permit by the children's pardon.

Dylan: All right. Then, how do you see the separation between church and state?

Maaike: In this case, the church was a good organization that could have asked for attention. They asked the Dutch government to review this situation again. Again, not all churches believe that every refugee should stay. Sometimes it is also better to go back to the country of origin.

Dylan: Right. Thank you for your answers, it was all very clear to me. Do you have a final word yourself?

Maaike: Thank you. I would like to end with that the city of The Hague has allowed this church shelter. Luckily, risks to public safety have never been an issue. The goal has been achieved, but I continue to wonder whether this would also be the case if the asylum had taken place in a mosque. That is another research.

Dylan: Thank you again. I will keep you informed of the research's outcome. I have a little present for you to thank you for your time and effort.

Maaike: Thank you! Good luck with your research and you should definitely keep me updated.

9.2. Informed Consent Form Interview Maaïke Harmsen

Informed Consent Form

Informed Consent Form

- 1) The Hague Church as a Place for Refuge
- 2) The Bethel Church in The Hague offered shelter to the Armenian family Tamrazyan from 26 October 2018 till 30 January 2019. The church had decided to keep an uninterrupted service to protect the family from being deported. The church's goal was eventually that the family could stay in The Netherlands. It was accomplished when the coalition parties decided that the entire current group of children would be reassessed.
- The Hague church asylum has left much impression on society. Not only on the municipality of The Hague, but also worldwide. More research needs to be done to find out whether the church shelter has strengthened the international profile of The Hague as a city of Peace and Justice. The assignment provider of this research is, therefore, the International Affairs Department of the city of The Hague.

recht obv
allican

two goals
- one attend
children na
- residence
permit
this family
2 keep
w
pardon

If you agree to take part in this study please read the following statement and sign this form.

I am 16 years of age or older.

I can confirm that I have read and understood the description and aims of this research. The researcher has answered all the questions that I had to my satisfaction.

I agree to the audio recording of my interview with the researcher.

I understand that the researcher offers me the following guarantees:

All information will be treated in the strictest confidence. My name will not be used in the study unless I give permission for it.

Recordings will be accessible only by the researcher. Unless otherwise agreed, anonymity will be ensured at all times. Pseudonyms will be used in the transcriptions.

I can ask for the recording to be stopped at any time and anything to be deleted from it.

I consent to take part in the research on the basis of the guarantees outlined above.

Signed:

M. Harmsen

Date:

1-04-2019

9.3. Transcript Interview John van Tilborg, managing director INLIA.**Van Tilborg, J. (2 April 2019). Personal Interview.**

Dylan: Thank you for your time today. I have already exchanged a few things about the background of my research with your secretary and I hope that you got the opportunity to read through it. I will summarize the event briefly again. As you may already know, The Hague's Bethel Chapel and Community Centre offered shelter to the Armenian family Tamrazyan from 26 October 2018 till 30 January 2019. The church had decided to keep an uninterrupted service to protect the family from being deported. The church had two goals: to get attention for the children's pardon and to get a residence permit for this particular family. It was accomplished when the Dutch coalition parties decided that the entire current group of children being processed by the government. The Hague's church asylum has left a great impression on society. Not only on the municipality of The Hague but has also gathered attention worldwide. More research needs to be done to find out whether the church shelter has strengthened the international profile of The Hague as city of Peace and Justice. The assignment provider for this research is the International Affairs Department of The City of The Hague. Do you agree on the content of this information?

John: Yes. Are you doing a research solely on the case of the Tamrazyan family?

Dylan: Yes, I am.

John: Great. You are a student European Studies, right?

Dylan: Correct, again. The Department requires a signature from you for the Informed Consent Form. In addition, I want to ask you if you have any objection to me recording the interview. Then I can write a transcript of this interview. Would you be all right with that?

John: Go ahead. I am curious.

Dylan: Thank you. The first thing I would like to know is if you, on behalf of INLIA, participated in the church asylum.

John: Very much. What may not have been published to the public, nor was it necessary, is that we as an organization have investigated the Tamrazyan file. Additionally, we also prepared the entire report for the State Secretary. Both with regard to the safety situation of the father's family and with regard to the application

of the children's pardon. I could say we have had extensive correspondence with the Dutch State Secretary. Of course, we have done this in compliance with the family, with the church, STEK, the lawyer and others involved.

Dylan: Thank you for this explanation. That information was new to me. At least I could not find anything on INLIA's website or in any other news article. If I understand correctly, your organization has contributed a lot to the church's desired goals.

John: Well, yes, but I also think those thousand volunteers, the preachers, other NGOs, the family itself and many others contributed to that. Of course, it was ultimately the Dutch government who decided to reassess the entire current group of asylum-seeking families. The Tamrazyan family had been eligible for children's pardon after five years. But only after five years and nine months did the family receive the first rejection. At that time, the family had been eligible for that children's pardon for nine months.

Dylan: I understand. That would also have been the motivation of your organization to help out. Additionally, I saw on your website that your organization, INLIA, stands for:

- Partner of churches - Partner of municipalities - Partner of refugees

In short, a partner of people. To elaborate further on "partner of churches":

Do you see Bethel's church asylum of the Tamrazyan family as an action to bring unity between different church movements in The Hague or the Netherlands?

John: Well, we have been involved in the conversations prior to the arrival of the family to The Hague. When the shelter was still taking place in Katwijk, we already had discussions with the churches of The Hague, those in Katwijk and with STEK. However, there were also discussions with several churches in Amsterdam or those in Kampen. With the discussions that preceded there, the considerations and choices of the Hague church were made independently. We were involved in this and provided the necessary input. During those discussions we debated on what exactly church shelter should mean; the expectations and the emotions attached.

Dylan: Right. I also read about the Charter of Groningen on your website. If I understood correctly, the charter is designed to get the right help during a church shelter. Has this charter also been applied in this situation?

John: No, the Bethel Church is not part of the Groningen Charter. We have spoken extensively with the church and that charter is the basis of our organization. But as said before, it has been the Hague's own independent choice.

Dylan: I understand. Earlier, you indicated in this interview that your organization provided legal assistance during the church shelter. Could you explain that a bit more?

John: Yes, of course. INLIA has done specific research into the Tamrazyan family. We have also done extensive research in their country of origin: Armenia. We have sent a special mission to the country for further investigation. We have done legal file research with a number of our lawyers in the Netherlands as well. In the end, a final, official note was written about the Tamrazyan family in compliance with the church and the family itself.

Dylan: I didn't know that. Thank you. I also understood that INLIA, together with STEK, have set up an emergency fund for the children's pardon. Meaning that families who have little money can also apply. Is that right?

John: Yes, we have published a booklet together with STEK from some of Hayarpi Tamrazyan's poems. The proceeds from this book go to a fund that supports the children from families who cannot finance the application. This way, the needs of children can be met. Otherwise you end up in situations where children cannot get rights, because they simply cannot afford it.

Dylan. I understand. If I understood correctly, your organization also has a Christian foundation. Is that correct too?

John: Yes, we were founded by local councils of churches. By the council of churches of Groningen, The Great Manchester Council of Churches (UK), the *Ökumenischer Kircherat* Berlin, the churches of Geneva, from Antwerp. At that time, they set up a Charter of Groningen together and signed it. Subsequently, INLIA was set up in Groningen. Thus, our organization was set up by locals with a two-part objective: supporting churches in their work for the stranger in need and providing direct support to asylum seekers in need.

Dylan: Right. The offices of your organization can therefore only be found in Groningen. There are no plans to expand to other cities?

John: No, only in Groningen. We are often active in The Hague. For instance, this morning I was still in The Hague and last Thursday and Tuesday as well. Actually, we must have offices in The Hague. However, that cannot be accomplished. It has to do with our history that is based on the Charter of Groningen.

Dylan: You are absolutely right about that.

John: Although I personally would have a great need to move to The Hague, haha.

Dylan: Many people have said the desired result of the church shelter was due to the many volunteers and NGOs involved. That has been confirmed by you in the beginning of this interview. However, much has been written on whether to honor is given to God for this outcome. How does your organization see this?

John: That is for everyone to decide on their own. Many people certainly assume that it has been an answered prayer. However, I always add that God also asks for actions. We must do something with our freedom of choice. If we do not act, it would become an endless prayer. I think it is not the intention to surrender it completely to God without acting. We have to make choices.

Dylan: Are you also convinced that social media, or classical media, has contributed to the positive positioning of the municipality of The Hague and Bethel's church desired result?

John: Media has certainly contributed. However, the Dutch media opted for an extremely reserved policy. Bethel's church asylum could be in the news every day. It has been chosen not to be too confrontational in the media. Mainly, not to confront the State Secretary.

Dylan: Do you think that it was also the attitude of The Hague's Municipality?

John: I think every party did the right thing. The Hague Municipality offered their space and certainty during Bethel's church asylum. Additionally, Bethel church has done what was within their capacity. This is how everyone acted within their power limits. It has also been very convincing that a few people have made considerable

effort. People have realized that the Tamrazyan family could not be deported and that justice should prevail based on the children's pardon.

Dylan: Indeed. Bethel's church asylum did not only reach believers, but also non-believers. Is that right?

John: Yes! That was the great thing about this case. It had very broad support.

Dylan: Right. Now, I am very curious if you are familiar with The Hague's international profile of Peace and Justice.

John: Yes, yes! Of course.

Dylan: Good. Do you also see the connection between Bethel's church asylum and The Hague's profile?

John: The connection is possible. It doesn't come naturally. You can either be an opponent or supporter of Bethel's church shelter. The supporters recognized the lack of justice in this specific case of the Tamrazyan family. They wanted to raise awareness and see justice prevail. Additionally, there has been great international publicity. I mean, I have seen eight publications from Indonesia and China, more than fourteen from Brazil. Even more publications in the New York Times, The Washington Post, CNN, BBC.

I think that international publicity was even bigger compared to national publicity. Even in Muslim countries Bethel's church asylum was explicitly mentioned. It was hot news, worldwide. I can imagine that not everyone was happy with that. Especially in The Hague it was a sensitive topic.

Dylan: Well described. Do you see Bethel's church asylum as an opportunity for the church to contribute more to society nowadays?

John: I think the role of the church is still underestimated and sometimes depoliticized. In some cases, I think that is wrong. I studied theology, just out of interest. One of my professors then taught me that if you really want to make a positive contribution as a Christian, you have to fight against the current. This was also endorsed in Bethel's church asylum. It does not mean that if you swim against

the current, you will not get there. It is a bit more complicated; the reward is bigger. Also, in Bethel's case. This was not just to secure the Tamrazyan family, we have changed the future for so many children in The Netherlands. Those thousands of pastors and volunteers have created results that do justice to so many children.

Dylan: You have clearly answered my questions and beyond. For that I would like to thank you. Do you have a final statement?

John: Churches nowadays should not pretend to represent only the higher purpose. Churches should be modest and helpful, like Bethel. We may realize that if we do the right thing for people, and ultimately also for the government, justice can be restored. Bethel's actions can be celebrated in The Hague, also by non-believers. In the future, I hope that people will also see churches differently. If you think you need more information, please do not hesitate to call me.

Dylan: That would be great! Again, thank you.

John: Good luck with your research.

9.4. Informed Consent Form Interview John van Tilborg

Informed Consent Form

Informed Consent Form

- 1) The Hague Church as a Place for Refuge
- 2) The Bethel Chapel & Community Centre in The Hague offered shelter to the Armenian family Tamrazyan from 26 October 2018 till 30 January 2019. The church had decided to keep an uninterrupted service to protect the family from being deported. The church had two goals: to get attention for the children's pardon and a residence permit for the Tamrazyan family. It was accomplished when the coalition parties decided that the entire group of children would be reassessed. The Hague church asylum has left much impression on society. Not only on the municipality of The Hague, but also worldwide. More research needs to be done to find out whether the church shelter has strengthened the international profile of The Hague as a city of Peace and Justice. The assignment provider of this research is, therefore, the International Affairs Department of the city of The Hague.

If you agree to take part in this study please read the following statement and sign this form.

I am 16 years of age or older.

I can confirm that I have read and understood the description and aims of this research. The researcher has answered all the questions that I had to my satisfaction.

I agree to the audio recording of my interview with the researcher.

I understand that the researcher offers me the following guarantees:

All information will be treated in the strictest confidence. My name will not be used in the study unless I give permission for it.

Recordings will be accessible only by the researcher. Unless otherwise agreed, anonymity will be ensured at all times. Pseudonyms will be used in the transcriptions.

I can ask for the recording to be stopped at any time and anything to be deleted from it.

I consent to take part in the research on the basis of the guarantees outlined above.

Signed: _____

Date: 09-04-2019.

9.5. Transcript Interview Sibel Kilinc, program manager international profiling of The Hague's City Branding Department.

Kilinc, S. (16 April 2019). Personal Interview.

Dylan: Sibel, thank you for your time today to allow me to do an interview. First, I would like to know if you knew about the church asylum in The Hague prior to our contact.

Sibel: Well, I knew about the situation, but I don't have a full detailed story for you.

Dylan: That is fine, I will provide you with a short summary. As you may already know, The Hague's Bethel Chapel and Community Centre offered shelter to the Armenian family Tamrazyan from 26 October 2018 till 30 January 2019. The church had decided to keep an uninterrupted service to protect the family from being deported. The church had two goals: to get attention for the children's pardon and to get a residence permit for this particular family. It was accomplished when the Dutch coalition parties decided that the entire current group of children being processed by the government. The Hague's church asylum has left a great impression on society. Not only on the municipality of The Hague but has also gathered attention worldwide. More research needs to be done to find out whether the church shelter has strengthened the international profile of The Hague as city of Peace and Justice. The brand your Bureau, City Branding, promotes. The assignment provider of this research is the Department where you often work for: The International Affairs Department of The City of The Hague. Are you following me?

Sibel: Yes, thank you! I hope I can be of any help as I am not an expert on this topic.

Dylan: Well, you are an expert on city branding and that is the main reason for this interview. The topic of city branding is an important part of my research as well.

Sibel: Oh, ok. I remember.

Dylan: Great. First, I would also like to mention that I need a signature from you for the Informed Consent Form. In addition, I want to ask you if you have any objection if I record the interview with my voice recorder for the transcript. Would that be all right?

Sibel: Absolutely fine!

Dylan: All right, let us start. I read on the official website of city branding that the Bureau's aim is promoting and strengthening the brand of The Hague. How does that work in practice?

Sibel: The Hague's brand is very broad. My focus is on the international aspect, the international profile that we want to convey as a city. As you know, it is the international city of peace and justice. What does that mean? We use the answers generated of that question due to the fact that the brand is an association. In other words, the desired association that we would like to achieve. I am now mainly thinking and working on how we can get the right association into the mind of our target group. Our actions are also linked to afore-set policies. This distinguishes City Branding from City Marketing.

Dylan: What does peace and justice mean specifically to you?

Sibel: Good question. I am currently working on a business marketing strategy in which we focus on the profit and the non-profit sector. In business terms, it is even more extensive than the NGOs and IDEs involved. We see that the city's profile is well-known in terms of reputation. This is apparent from investigations and official reports. People know how to link The Hague to the city of peace and justice. However, it is now time to define the brand a little better.

We look at the trend of development that you see in daily life. For instance, nowadays employees are busy with the drive of building a better world. This can be achieved by improving working conditions. At the same time, they are looking for special talents. Those talents are increasingly looking for meaning as well. If you are looking for a high salary and a fancy car, then you have to move to Amsterdam. However, if you really want to build a better world...Then yes, you have to come to The Hague. Our city has a stronger focus on talent and the employees that go with it. At the same time, we are also trying to explain more by what we mean by building a better world.

Dylan: What could it mean?

Sibel: Of course, you have the pillars of our city: peace, justice and security on which our brand is built. But if we look at the peace aspect, we must realize that you cannot get the most out of it economically. Therefore, we are looking for a modern

translation of those pillars. Think about innovations, today's technology which could be linked to doing good in the world.

Dylan: If I understand correctly, those are also concrete steps to doing well and working towards a better world.

Sibel: That is right, it is about better positioning. Justice is also a well-known pillar. It is known for maintaining the international legal order that the Netherlands has established in its constitution. The Hague embodies that with the International Criminal Court. Our city is called the Capital of Law for a reason. We are currently working on how to deal with law in the digital world. How should we deal with the limitless use of the internet and the security around it? That is what we are currently working on as City Branding.

Dylan: Right, thank you. During our conversations prior to this interview, we also discussed the influence of media on the positioning of The Hague. The Dutch media consciously chose to pay little attention to Bethel's church shelter. However, these agreements did not apply internationally which why it could spread all over the world.

Sibel: Why did The Netherlands decide to pay little attention?

Dylan: There were multiple reasons. The municipality wanted to guarantee safety around the neighbourhood where the asylum took place. Additionally, the conscious choice was made due to the fact that without noise and publicity there would be more chance to arrange something behind the scenes for the family. The newspaper articles suspected that the State Secretary had become irritated with the great publicity surrounding the Lili and Howick case. Therefore, Bethel wanted to operate as silent as possible. Has the municipality consciously chosen to remain on the background?

Sibel: Ah! Clearly. Yes, I think so. In this case we have not actively monitored as City Branding. There was no specific mission of the municipality. This is mainly due to the fact that it was a national issue. The municipality then makes less pronounced statements when it comes to national politics. You can say that Bethel's church asylum has contributed to the city of The Hague, because we are also protective of asylum-seekers. However, due to the fact that the case was politically sensitive, a conscious decision has been made from the town hall not to interfere.

Dylan: Was that also the reason why the City Branding Bureau also followed the policy of the City Council?

Sibel: Yes, we are not yet at that stage with City Branding that we can respond to current events like this. The only thing we can do is to see if it has contributed to the international brand of the city of The Hague afterwards. I think that is what you are doing with your research right now. We do consciously look at issues in the city as to what impact that will have on the municipality. We should do that more actively, but the right monitoring is required.

Dylan: We can conclude that the municipality consciously chose not to interfere in the matter as it was politically sensitive. Is it true that the municipality often follows national politics and distances itself from it as little as possible?

Sibel: Indeed, they try to do this as little as possible. But do you know what has been communicated by the municipality? Regarding the case of the Tamrazyan family.

Dylan: Yes, there has been some communication. The mayor, Pauline Krikke, and Alderman for Integration, Rachid Guernaoui, indicated in an interview that the family did not have to fear an invasion by the authorities. The church is said to be protected on the basis of the Law of Entry, which states that the authority may not disturb during a church service. However, this law is not intended for sheltering asylum-seekers. Meaning that the authorities could actually have disrupted the service. Pauline communicated that the matter was not a high priority on the agenda. As long as the safety of the citizen remained guaranteed. This also strengthened the church's motivation to continue.

Sibel: I can appreciate the role of the municipality of The Hague and communication in this. They are responsible for the safety in the city after all. They are not responsible for national politics. The church's goal was to appeal to the government, if I understood correctly.

Dylan: That is right. Now I am wondering if you also believe that Bethel's church asylum has contributed to the brand of The Hague? In other words, whether it has contributed to the international city of peace and justice?

Sibel: Personally, I think that if the international city claims to be peace and justice, then you can also go a step further, in comparison with other cities, on guaranteeing that brand. Being the city of Peace and Justice means having the embassies, international companies and, above all, having the International Criminal Court. However, the Dutch government also seeks to have no more homeless people in the city. Those things also contribute to peace and justice. This also reinforces the city's credibility. Especially, if it is arranged well internally. At the same time, I think it is powerful if, for example, every major city in the Netherlands accommodates 200 asylum-seekers, The Hague would receive 300. These kinds of ambitions could actually add an extra dimension to The Hague's brand. Thus, not only the things that we are doing as City Branding strengthens The Hague's brand. Actions, such as Bethel's church asylum, is a great example of citizens' initiative.

Dylan: I understand. The church shelter has also proven to be an example of solidarity, in which believers but also non-believers were involved. Many residents of The Hague also supported the matter and supported Bethel's church asylum. If I have just understood your story correctly, do you believe that the church shelter has positively influenced the brand of The Hague?

Sibel: Yes, I absolutely think so. As I said, City Branding is not just what the City Hall does, but precisely what happens in the city. I think that is even more important. It is our goal to get a city that naturally undertakes things where the core values of our brand are expressed. One of those core values is, for example, "binding" or "unlimited". I am convinced that these two examples returned in Bethel's church asylum. These types of actions, where local cooperation and organizations are involved, underline the values of our city. I am convinced that it has strengthened The Hague's brand of peace and justice.

Dylan: I believe it is also a reflection of good policy if people in the city start to undertake things that strengthen The Hague's brand. Meaning that people feel free enough in this city to move within those political fields of tension. Is that right?

Sibel: That is right. It is very interesting to find out what motivates the people in the city to do this kind of thing. Often, because they really feel like a *Hagenaar* and are part of this city.

Dylan: Right. I want to thank you for all your answers and I have the feeling that I now have a clear picture of the City Branding Bureau. Is there anything from you that you want to share to close this interview?

Sibel: No, but this interview makes me think about how you can better link these kinds of current events in the future to promote The Hague's brand. It is interesting that we can measure our reputation based on the issues that take place in the city. Or to see whether the brand of The Hague also motivates people in the city to act.

Dylan: Thank you again for your time today.

Sibel: Thank you. It makes me re-think it all over again. For now, good luck with your dissertation.

Dylan: Thank you. I will keep you updated.

9.6. Informed Consent Form Interview Sibel Kilinc

Informed Consent Form

Informed Consent Form

- 1) The Hague Church as a Place for Refuge
- 2) The Bethel Chapel & Community Centre in The Hague offered shelter to the Armenian family Tamrazyan from 26 October 2018 till 30 January 2019. The church had decided to keep an uninterrupted service to protect the family from being deported. The church had two goals: to get attention for the children's pardon and a residence permit for the Tamrazyan family. It was accomplished when the coalition parties decided that the entire group of children would be reassessed. The Hague church asylum has left much impression on society. Not only on the municipality of The Hague, but also worldwide. More research needs to be done to find out whether the church shelter has strengthened the international profile of The Hague as a city of Peace and Justice. The assignment provider of this research is, therefore, the International Affairs Department of the city of The Hague.

If you agree to take part in this study please read the following statement and sign this form.

I am 16 years of age or older.

I can confirm that I have read and understood the description and aims of this research. The researcher has answered all the questions that I had to my satisfaction.

I agree to the audio recording of my interview with the researcher.


I understand that the researcher offers me the following guarantees:

All information will be treated in the strictest confidence. My name will not be used in the study unless I give permission for it.

Recordings will be accessible only by the researcher. Unless otherwise agreed, anonymity will be ensured at all times. Pseudonyms will be used in the transcriptions.

I can ask for the recording to be stopped at any time and anything to be deleted from it.

I consent to take part in the research on the basis of the guarantees outlined above.

Signed:  Date: 17-07-2019.

9.7. Student's Ethics Form

**European Studies
Student Ethics Form**

Your name: Dylan Kraijenoord

Supervisor: Margriet Krijtenburg

Instructions/checklist

Before completing this form you should read the APA Ethics Code (<http://www.apa.org/ethics/code/index.aspx>). If you are planning research with human subjects you should also look at the sample consent form available in the Final Project and Dissertation Guide.

- a. ☒ Read section 3 that your supervisor will have to sign. Make sure that you cover all these issues in section 1.
- b. ☒ Complete sections 1 and, if you are using human subjects, section 2, of this form, and sign it.
- c. ☒ Ask your project supervisor to read these sections (and the draft consent form if you have one) and sign the form.
- d. ☒ Append this signed form as an appendix to your dissertation.

Section 1. Project Outline (to be completed by student)

(i) Title of Project:

Peace and Justice in The Hague Church

(ii) Aims of project:

The purpose of this report is to document research conducted at The Hague University of Applied Sciences, commissioned by The Hague's International Affairs Department, on the topic of the Bethel's church asylum of the Tamrazyan family in The Hague. The specific case of the Tamrazyan family, who found sanctuary in Bethel's Chapel and community centre, has been researched to find out whether it strengthened The Hague's brand of peace and justice.

- (iii) Will you involve other people in your project – e.g. via formal or informal interviews, group discussions, questionnaires, internet surveys etc. (Note: if you are using data that has already been collected by another researcher – e.g. recordings or transcripts of conversations given to you by your supervisor, you should answer 'NO' to this question.)**

YES / ~~NO~~

If no: you should now sign the statement below and return the form to your supervisor. You have completed this form.

This project is not designed to include research with human subjects. I understand that I do not have ethical clearance to interview people (formally or informally) about the topic of my research, to carry out internet research (e.g. on chat rooms or discussion boards) or in any other way to use people as subjects in my research.

Student's signature _____



date May 21, 2019

If yes: you should complete the rest of this form.

Section 2 Complete this section only if you answered YES to question (iii) above.

(i) What will the participants have to do? (v. brief outline of procedure):

In order to gain a better understanding of the effects the church asylum posed on society, three semi-structured interviews were conducted with the most important stakeholders of the event. The stakeholders were chosen based on their relevance and contribution to the church asylum period of October 2018 till February 2019. The interviews were conducted at the Hague city hall, in Katwijk and in Rijswijk. The meetings lasted approximately 25-40 minutes each. The answers that were given were recorded, and written by note-taking, with consent.

(ii) What sort of people will the participants be and how will they be recruited?

The participants were Sibel Kilinc, program manager international profiling for The Hague's Department of City Branding. Additionally, an interview was conducted with theologian Maaïke Harmsen as she was the last person to preach at the Bethel church before the asylum ended for the family. The last stakeholder is John van Tilborg, managing director of INLIA. This organization has investigated the Tamrazyan family's file. All three stakeholders were recruited via e-mail contact.

(iii) What sort stimuli or materials will your participants be exposed to, tick the appropriate boxes and then state what they are in the space below?

Questionnaires[]; Pictures[]; Sounds []; Words[☒]; Other[].

The participants were provided with a written summary of Bethel's church asylum to better understand the purpose of the interview.

(iv) Consent: Informed consent must be obtained for all participants before they take part in your project. By means of an informed consent form you should state what participants will be doing, drawing attention to anything they could conceivably object to subsequently. You should also state how they can withdraw from the study at any time and the measures you are taking to ensure the confidentiality of data. A standard informed consent form is available in the Dissertation Manual.

(vi) What procedures will you follow in order to guarantee the confidentiality of participants' data?

The participant's name will not be used in the study unless they gave permission for it. Additionally, the recordings will only be accessible by the researcher and the supervisor.

Student's signature:  date: May 21, 2019

Supervisor's signature (if satisfied with the proposed procedures): date: 21-5-2019

